

# On the manuscript of Phya pa Chos kyi seng ge's *Tshad ma yid kyi mun sel*

Created: 6.9.2016  
Last update: 6.9.2017

This document has been started by Pascale Hugon (pascale.hugon@oeaw.ac.at) in the framework of the Project P23422-G15 “Early bKa' gdams pa scholasticism – Phya pa Chos kyi seng ge's contribution” generously supported by the Austrian Science Fund (FWF).

This work is licensed under the **Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 4.0 International License**. To view a copy of this license, visit <http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-sa/4.0/> or send a letter to Creative Commons, PO Box 1866, Mountain View, CA 94042, USA.

## Manuscript

A single manuscript of the *Tshad ma yid kyi mun sel* (abbreviated: *Mun sel*) (“Epistemology – the dispeller of mental darkness”) by Phya pa Chos kyi seng ge (1109–1169)<sup>1</sup> has surfaced so far in the library of 'Bras spungs monastery (cat. number 016329).<sup>2</sup>

It consists of 97 folios numbered on the left margin on the recto, from 2 (on the second folio: *gnyis*) to 96 (on the last folio: *go drug [bzhugs] [s.ho']*), with an additional folio numbered “*nyer brgyad g[ong ma']*” which contains a portion of text to be read between the end of fol. 27b and the beginning of fol. 28a (it is referred to below as folio 27').

Size according to the 'Bras spungs *dkar chag*: 64 × 10.2 cm.

9 lines per folio (exceptions: 8 on 28b, 10 on 57b, and 4 on 96a).

Two sets of images of the same manuscript are available:

- A. Scan of the manuscript published in the *bKa' gdams gsung 'bum*, vol. 8, 434–626. Scans of this publication accessible via TBRC (W1PD89051, Open access).
- B. Scans of a photocopy of the manuscript by the Tibetan Buddhist Resource Center (TBRC, Volume Number 2077, Work Number 12171, Open access). Mention as a place of production: gNyal dre'u dgon.

The legibility of the two versions slightly varies. B has in most cases a better resolution and a clearer reading. On the other hand, some marginal notes on the edges of the folios are only visible on A (the edges of the manuscript are folded up on B). Some interlinear notes are only legible on B. Some characters are clearly legible on A but appear as deleted by erasing on B. It is unclear whether such cases are a matter of the legibility of the images or are due to the intervention of a modern reader. Such an intervention is evident in the case of small circles marking the beginning of important sections in the text, which are only present on A.

The image of the additional folio 27' is printed in the correct place in A, but appears after fol. 28b in B.

Folios 87a and 86b are misplaced in the reproduction of A in the *bKa' gdams gsung 'bum*, which prints the folios in the following order: 86a (p. 606), 87b (p. 607), 87a (p. 608), 86b (p. 609), 88a (610).

A transcribed version of the text in A, printed in *dbu can* script, was published in: *Phya pa Chos kyi seng ge. Phya pa chos kyi seng ge'i gsung gces btus dbu tshad kyi yig cha*. Lhasa, 2012: Bod ljongs bod yig dpe rnying dpe skrun khang (Byang chub ljon bzang, no. 6), 585–916.

---

<sup>1</sup> On Phya pa's life and works, see the compilation available at: <http://www.ikga.oeaw.ac.at/mediawiki/images/7/73/CompiledInformationPhyaPa.pdf>.

<sup>2</sup> This text was previously introduced in van der Kuijp 2003 and Hugon 2008: 39–45.

This transcription includes some editorial emendations (that are not explicitly noted by the editors) and a partial normalization of the orthography according to the rules of classical Tibetan.

This edition does not correct the misplacement of folios 86b and 87a in the publication of A. Thus, the transcription on p. 885 jumps from the end of 86b9 (... 'phen pa) to 87b1 (thal ba 'i spyi...). The transcription of folio 87a appears after that of 87b (on p. 887,2–888,17), and is followed by that of folio 86b (p. 888,17–890,9). After that, the text continues in the correct order with the transcription of fol. 88a, etc.

## Cover page

Fol. 1a, in the center: *tshad ma yid kyi mun sel zhes bya ba bzhugs\_s.ho /*

Above it (only visible on B): phyi<sup>3</sup>, zha<sup>4</sup>, 11

## Beginning of the text

- Title (1b1): *rgya gar skad du / [ph]ra ma na ma<.>na:×ta ma:×tā na ba nā ma // bod skad du / tshad ma yid kyi mun pa sel ba zhes bya ba //*
- Invocation (1b1): *'jam pa 'i dbyangs la phyag 'tshal lo // bla ma rnams la phyag 'tshal lo //*
- Introductory verses (1b1–4):

*brtser ldan nam mkha 'i mthas gtugs 'gro rnams srid pa 'i mtsho ' las bs(gr)al ba 'i blos //  
rma d byung dka' spyad dge tshogs mthar phyung blo gros 1b2 dri med legs sbyangs te //  
mi shes mun bcom shes bya mtha' med spros pa {''''''''} zhi bar gsal ldan pas //  
'gro rnams kun mkhyen lam du khrid par mdzad pa de la phyag 'tshal lo //*

*rigs pa 'i gzi ' ldan blo gsal dkyil 'khor brtsi ba 'i 'od kyi dra ba can //  
spobs pa myur 'jug gsung gi zer gyis lhang na mun pa 'i tshogs 'joms shing //  
ji bzhin ji snyed mkha' dang sna tshogs lus can ma lus 1b3 kun ston la //  
skal ldan blo 'i pad mo kha 'byed (n)i gsal bla ma 'i tshogs la 'dud //*

*mtshan nyid dang ni mam 'grel mdzad dang de lugs rjes 'jug blo ldan gyis //  
gsal bar ma byas rigs pa 'i tshul ni cung zad yod min yang //  
tshig tsam ma yin dngos stobs las 'ongs rtags kyi rjes 'brang rigs pa yis //  
rnam par gnas pa tshad ma 'i snang pa yid kyi mun sel 'dir brjod bya //*

*'di don legs par rtogs 1b4 na thub dbang gsung ni dgongs 'grel bcas // {2 syllables missing}  
skyob pa 'i thabs dang ji bzhin don rnam 'byed cing dngos dang dngos min tshogs //  
rnam dpyod blo yis legs par smra bas lta ngan spobs pa zhi byed la //  
lam ngan thag bsrings mchog gi lam zhugs kun mkhyen mi 'i dbang por 'gyur // //*

## Closing verses

*mdo ' dang rnam 'grel rnam bshad rigs pa 'i gzhung bzung du ma las /  
de nyid don la nyer mkho ' dngos stobs las 'ongs rigs pa rnams //  
dngos por smra ba 'i ngan rtog dug 95b6 chu 'i dri mas ma sbags par //  
ma 'dres don gyi snying po legs par bdag gis phye ba lags / { }  
grub pa 'i mtha' la grags pas rigs pa 'i tshul du bzhag pa dang //  
sgrub byed skyes bu 'i lung la rten nas nges pa dor nas ni //  
gzhal bya 'jal 95b7 byed ji bzhin don rnams 'khrul med myong pa dang //  
rtags la rten nas 'ongs te gzhan du min pa 'di dag yin //  
deng sang skye bo phal cher phan pa 'i don la rgyab phyogs shing //  
legs par smra bar shas kyang phrag dog dri mas smod 'gyur mod //  
mang du byas shing goms las shes bya 'i gnas lugs nges rtogs nas //  
nam mkha' ji srid gnas pa 'i 95b8 kun mkhyen rgyal por 'gyur ba yin //  
bsod nams 'di yis 'gro rnams rigs pa 'i tshul 'di nges rtogs nas //  
rmongs pa 'i rab rib bsal te yang dag lta la gnas pa dang //  
shes rab snying brtser ldan pas theg pa mchog gi lam zhugs nas //  
srid pa gsum gyi bla ma chos kyi rgyal por 'gyur bar shog //  
95b9 rigs tshul 'di la blo gros gsal ldan skyes bu che rnams kyis //  
phyogs dang phyogs 'tshams kun du gsal ba 'i grags pas khyab pa dang //*

<sup>3</sup> Indicates a text brought from the outside.

<sup>4</sup> Marks the genre of the text, Zha=*tshad ma*.

ngan rtog rlom pa'i mun pa'i tshogs chen bsal nas ni //  
 rgyal ba'i bstan pa dri med snang pa rab du rgyas gyur cig //  
 bdag kyang deng nas byang chub bar du mi'i dpal bzang po //  
 96a1 mngon par brgyud de rig tshul nges pa'i snang pa 'dis brgyan nas //  
 snying brtser bcas pas ngan rtog mngon rlom <glang> chen bye ba brgya'i //  
 glad 'gems rigs par smra ba'i chos kyi seng [g]er gyur par shog // //

thub pa'i dbang pos skal pa stobs ci na brgya phrag du ma dang //  
 rgyal hras rnams kyi skal pa bye ba brgya dang stong lasogs //  
 'bad pa 96a2 mang pos chos kyi de nyid don rnams legs rtogs nas //  
 legs par bshad pa'i chos ni blo dman rkang brkyang spyod yul myin //  
 de phyr bka' dang bstan bcas don la 'jug par 'dod pa rnams //  
 yid kyi mun sel 'di don 'bad pas khon du chud byos la //  
 rigs pa'i thur mas blo gros myig ni phye nas kyang //  
 gzhung gi snang pas ji bzhin ji snyed don rnams blta bar gyis // //

## Colophon

Fol. 96a3: *tshad ma yid kyi mun pa sel pa zhes bya ba blo gsal zhing rigs par smra bas rtog ge ngan pa'i gzhung 'jig pa brtul zhugs mchog la legs par gnas pa'i dge slong chos kyi seng ges nye bar sbyar ba / rdzogs s.hō //*

## Calligrapher's colophon

Fol. 96a4: *mkhas pa'i 'byung gnas bsod nams dpal gyis brjid // legs gsungs dgongs 'grel chos kyi rin chen mdzod / / dam pa'i 'phreng mdzes dge legs gang chen mtsho' // bri'u la[s] gtsug lag khang du bdag gis bris // dge zhing bkris // maM g.ha la: b.ha wa tu : | dge'o:*

## Title

- Title on the cover page (fol. 1a): *Tshad ma yid kyi mun sel.*
- Title given at the beginning of the text (fol. 1b1): *Tshad ma yid kyi mun pa sel ba.* The author also provides a Sanskrit equivalent: *Pramāṇamanastamastānavah.*<sup>5</sup>
- Title in the colophon (fol. 96a3): *Tshad ma yid kyi mun pa sel pa.*

## Author

Authorship given in the colophon (fol. 96a3): *dge slong chos kyi seng ge.*

## Scribe

According to the calligrapher's colophon, calligraphed by mKhas pa'i 'byung gnas bSod nams dpal at Bri'u las gTsug lag khang.

## Date

According to TBRC's estimation: 14<sup>th</sup> c.

## Script

*Dbu med* script. Identified as 'Bru tsha in the 'Bras spungs dkar chag.

## Orthographical and graphical particularities

The text testifies to a number of orthographical particularities, most of which, however, are not systematical. The absence of systematic orthography may be due to the scribe copying from a manuscript with older orthographical conventions and reproducing those only on occasion, or simply to the existence of alternative acceptable conventions at the time the text was first written down.

### Orthographical particularities

- Palatalization of *ma* by *ya* *btags* (frequent on the first folio, rare afterwards)
- Superabundant 'a *rjes* 'jug (ex. *gzhi* ', *dbye* ')

<sup>5</sup> This title might be influenced by the introductory verse of Dharmottara's *Nyāyabinduṭīkā*, in which one finds the term *manastamastānavam* (Tib. *yid kyi mun pa sbyong bar mdzad*). On the Tibetan custom of including bilingual titles for autochthonous works see Almogi 2005: 51–54.

- Flexible use of prefixes for verbal forms and their derivatives: *sgrub bya/bsgrub bya*, *sgrub pa/bsgrub pa*, *gzung bya/bzung bya*, *gzung don/bzung don*, *gzung yul/bzung yul*, *gcad pa'i yul can/bcad pa'i yul can*
- The *la don* takes the form *du* after final *-b* (ex. *kun rdzob du*, *rab du dbye ba*) and final *-g* (ex. *cig du*).
- The particle *pa/ba* takes the form *pa* after final *-ng* (ex. *mthong pa*, *snang pa*) and final *-l* (ex. *sel pa*, but one sometimes finds *'khrul ba* in alternance with *'khrul pa*).
- Different spelling used alternatively for some words (ex. *cig* or *gcig*, *the tsom* or *the tshom*)
- *ldog* frequently used instead of *bzlog*
- Use of the expression *yin men* (for *yin min* or *yin nam min*)
- Spelling differing from classical Tibetan, used consistently: *log rtogs* (for *log rtog*), *rkang thil* (for *rkang mthil*)
- *la sogs pa* consistently spelled *lasogs pa*
- Enclitics (*'ang*, *'am*, *'i*, *'o*) frequently appear as a separate syllable
- Consistent use of the *tsheg* before a *shad*.

### Graphical particularities

- use of the *bindu* instead of final *ma* (especially in insertions)
- character *na* for *med* (rare)
- use of the reverse *i* (*gigu log*) (rare, ex. 3b8: *'di'i*, 6b2 ngo bo *cig*, 6b2 po'i)
- use of numerals for numbers (ex. 2 for *gnyis*) or for their phonetic value (ex. *skad 1* for *skad cig*)

### Corrections and additions

Modifications of the text written down, by the scribe himself or a later reader include:

- Deletions by one or two small strokes, by erasing, by crossing, by circling or parentheses-like if the passage to be deleted runs over several lines.
- Insertions below the line (in *dbu med*, or *dbu can* in the case of single letters being added), or on the top or bottom of the folio in the case of longer passages, often marked by a small “x”-sign or another reference sign in the case of marginal insertions. Some insertions appear to be additions rather than corrections.

### Internal organization

The text has an (almost) exhaustive organization into sections and subsections (except at the very end of the text)<sup>6</sup>, and a five-fold chapter division:

1. blo'i dbye ba nges pa (1b5–11a5)
2. tshad ma'i mtshan nyid dbye' ba rnam par nges pa (11a5–41b5)
3. mngon sum gyi tshad ma rnam par nges pa (41b5–43a7)
4. rjes su dpag pa rnam par nges pa (43a7–81b8)
5. rtsod pa'i ngag gi tshul rnam par nges pa (81b8–96a3)

### Persons mentioned in the text

	Identification	Folio
<b>Indian authors</b>		
rGyan mdzad pa	Prajñākaragupta	32a2, 32a3, 32a4
mDo mdzad pa	Dignāga	53b4
mTshan nyid mdzad <sup>7</sup>		1b3
rNam 'grel mdzad pa	Dharmakīrti	1b3, 53b4
Bram ze chen po	Śāṅkaranandana	32a3, 80b6
Slob dpon Bram ze chen po		4b7

<sup>6</sup> The outline is available at <http://www.ikga.oeaw.ac.at/PhyaPaChosKyiSengGe>.

<sup>7</sup> See for instance Jñānagarbha's SDV-vṛtti introducing SDV 6d (Eckel 1992: 158) for a reference to Dignāga and Dharmakīrti in terms of 'mtshan nyid dang rnam 'grel byed pa.'

Mu stegs sNod kyi rje	Pātrasvāmin	59b7
Slob dpon Ka ma la shi lasogs pa dag	Kamalaśīla, etc.	54b3
Slob dpon Chos kyi grags pa (lasogs pa)	Dharmakīrti, etc.	65b1
Slob dpon Chos mchog	Dharmottara	4a8, 32a3, 32b5, 37b2, 37b5, 40a4, 44a7, 71a8, 80a8
Slob dpon Dul lha	Vinītadeva	41b6
Slob dpon Shan ti ba	Ratnākaraśānti	64b9
Slob dpon lHa dbang blo	Devendrabuddhi	32a2, 32a3, 32a9
<b>Tibetan authors</b>		
Blo ldan bzang po	rNgog Blo ldan shes rab	41b7, 44a8, 80b8
<b>Anonymous / unidentified</b>		
kha cig	rGya?	5b1, 27'b8, 44a9
kha cig	Gangs pa?	87b5
kha cig	Byang [chub] skyabs ?	89a9
kha cig	rNgog Blo ldan shes rab ?	88b7
kha cig		8a3, 10a1, 10a2, 10b2, 11a3, 11a4, 11b2, 26b8, 27'a4, 27'a7, 33b2, 34a5, 40b3, 46b2, 60a4, 60a8, 61b1, 62a2, 63b7, 66b3, 67a8, 68b2, 69b9, 71a1, 75a6, 81a8
kha cig na re		30a2, 35a3, 63b5, 73a9
snga rabs pa'i mkhas pa dag		50b2
sngon gyi mkhas pa dag	Gangs pa?/Khyung?	87a4
sngon gyi mkhas pa dag	rNgog Blo ldan shes rab?	91b7
sngon gyi mkhas pa kha cig	Gangs pa?	27'b8
che ba'i che ba rnam	rNgog Blo ldan shes rab?	94a6
bsTan bcos byed pa		44b9
bdag cag gi bla ma dag		50b2–3, 72b7
bdag cag gi bla ma kha cig		51a1
blo chung ngur gyur kyang mchog du rlom pa kha cig	Me dig pa?	27'b2

### Texts mentioned or cited in the text

	Identification	Folio
Kun las btus	Pramāṇasamuccaya	43b1
mDo'		95b5
gTan tshigs thigs pa	Hetubindu (actually a citation of PV IV.262)	6a2
<rTog ge'i bstan bcos>	Pramāṇavārttika I.166ab=PVin II.56ab	insertion ad 33a5
sDe bdun	Dharmakīrti's Seven works	43b1
rNam 'grel	Pramāṇavārttika	95b5
rNam par nges pa	Pramāṇaviniścaya	58b3
Bar ti ka	Pramāṇavārttika II.1ab <sub>1</sub> and II.5c	32a3
dBu ma pa'i gzhung	Yuktiṣaṣṭikā 35	33a5
---	Pramāṇavārttika I.200	37a9
---	Pramāṇavārttika III.37d	44b7
---	Pramāṇavārttika III.153cd	44b7
---	Pramāṇavārttika III.460	8b2
---	Vākyapadīya 2.255	44b4–5

### Bibliographical references

*bKa' gdams gsung 'bum*

*bKa' gdams gsung 'bum phyogs sgrig thengs dang po*, ed. by dPal brtsegs bod yig dpe rnying zhib 'jug khang, Chengdu, 2006: Si khron mi rigs dpe skrun khang.

*'Bras spungs dkar chag*

*'Bras spungs dgon du bzhugs su gsol ba 'i dpe rnying dkar chag*, 2 Vols, ed. by dPal brtsegs bod yig dpe rnying zhib 'jug khang. Beijing, 2005: Mi rigs dpe skrun khang.

Almogi 2005

Orna Amogi, “Analysing Tibetan Titles: Towards a genre-base classification of Tibetan literature,” *Cahiers d'Extrême-Asie* 15, 27–58.

Eckel 1992

Malcolm David Eckel, *Jñānagarbha's Commentary on the Distinction Between the Two Truths*, Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass.

Hugon 2008

Pascale Hugon, *Trésors du raisonnement. Sa skya Paṇḍita et ses prédécesseurs tibétains sur les modes de fonctionnement de la pensée et le fondement de l'inférence. Edition et traduction annotée du quatrième chapitre et d'une section du dixième chapitre du Tshad ma rigs pa'i gter*. Vienna: Arbeitskreis für Tibetische und Buddhistische Studien (Wiener Studien zur Tibetologie und Buddhismuskunde 69.1 and 69.2).

van der Kuijp 2003

Leonard van der Kuijp, “A Treatise on Buddhist Epistemology and Logic Attributed to Klong chen Rab 'byams pa (1308-1364) and Its Place in Indo-Tibetan Intellectual History,” *Journal of Indian Philosophy* 31, 381–437.