

Edition of Phya pa Chos kyi seng ge's excursus on direct proofs in his commentary on the *Pramānaviniścaya*

Version 1

First created: 06.04.2016

Last update: 07.04.2016

© Pascale Hugon, 2016. Open access - please exercise fair use.

The work on this edition has been generously supported by the Austrian Science Fund (FWF) in the context of the Project P23422-G15 “Early bKa’ gdams pa scholasticism.”

Foreword

This document contains an edition of the excursus on direct proofs in the *Tshad ma rnam par nges pa'i 'grel bshad yi ge dang rigs pa'i gnad la 'jug pa'i shes rab kyi 'od zer* (143a1–143b7), a commentary on Dharmakīrti's *Pramānaviniścaya* composed by the Tibetan scholar Phya pa Chos kyi seng ge.¹ This excursus follows the word-explanation of the first verse of the third chapter of the *Pramānaviniścaya*, in which Dharmakīrti defines inference-for-others.

The edition is based on the manuscript published in the *bKa' gdams gsung 'bum phyogs sgrig thengs dang po*, ed. by dPal brtsegs bod yig dpe mnying zhib 'jug khang, Chengdu, 2006: Si khron mi rigs dpe skrun khang, vol. 8, 35–427.

The parallel discussion in the author's *Tshad ma yid kyi mun sel* (81b8–83a1) is edited in Pascale Hugon (2011), “Argumentation Theory in the Early Tibetan Epistemological Tradition,” *Journal of the International Association of Buddhist Studies* 34.1–2 (2011)[2012], 97–148. (<https://journals.ub.uni-heidelberg.de/index.php/jiabs/article/view/10600/4452>).

The present edition preserves the orthographical characteristics of the manuscript, such as palatalisation of *ma* by *ya btags* and superabundant *'a rjes 'jug*.

It proposes emendation only in the case of obvious scribal mistakes or when the meaning required it.

Emendations are marked as follows:

[+] for syllables/words to be added to the text of the manuscript

[] for syllables/words to be deleted from the text of the manuscript.

For instance:

yod pas stong pas [+khyab pas thal ba][⁻thal bas khyab pa] rjes 'gro dang ldan

means that the manuscript reads

yod pas stong pas thal bas khyab pa rjes 'gro dang ldan

and the emended text should read:

yod pas stong pas khyab pas thal ba rjes 'gro dang ldan

<> indicate insertions by the scribe or a reader. When the insertion is believed to represent an addition to the original text rather than a mere correction the text is given in a footnote.

{ } indicate deletion by the scribe by means of small strokes

{ { } } indicate deletion by the scribe by erasing

{ { { } } } indicate deletions by the scribe by means of crossing.

Numbered titles, folio and line numbers, coloring, highlighting, italics, boldface and underlining are purely editorial.

In particular, the following color-marking is used to facilitate the reading of the text:

<i>sgra skad cig mas stong pas mig gi gzung byas stong par thal zhes</i>	: argument by consequence
<i>mig gi gzung bya yin pas skad cig yin zhes</i>	: direct proof
<i>bde bar gshegs pa ba</i>	: members of a school
<i>gzhan dag, kha cig</i>	: anonymous opponents
<i>gal te ... zhe na /</i>	: objections

¹ On this scholar's life and works, see

<http://www.ikga.oeaw.ac.at/mediawiki/images/7/73/CompiledInformationPhyaPa.pdf>.

*Tshad ma rnam par nges pa'i 'grel bshad yi ge dang rigs pa'i gnad la 'jug pa'i shes rab
kyi 'od zer (143a1–143b7)*

'dir yang rgol ba dang phyir rgol ba'i mtshan nyid dang / de la bsgrub pa'i ngag 'jug pa'i skabs dang /
skabs de la rten pa'i sbyor ba'i dbye ba dang / bsgrub pa'i ngag gi mtshan nyid bzhis ^{143a2} rnam par
gzhag go /

1 rgol ba dang phyir rgol ba'i mtshan nyid

dang po la **rgol ba** ni bsgrub bya de la dmigs pa'i rjes dpag skyed 'dod pa'i dpag 'dod dang ldan pa'o /
phyir rgol ni rgol bas rjes dpag skyed par 'dod pa'i yul lo ///

2 de la bsgrub pa'i ngag 'jug pa'i skabs

gnyis pa ni rang gis rtags dang khyab pa ma nges na bsgrub pa ltar snang par 'gyur la / de la blo kha
ma phyogs na bsgrub pa myi 'jug cing de la gnyi ga tshad mas nges pa la blo kha phyogs na rang la
rjes ^{143a3} dpag myi skye bar 'gal bas rang la rjes dpag skyes pa dang / gzhan la grub bsal byung na zhes
rjes dpag skyed 'dod 'jug pa 'gal bas gzhan la grub bsal myed pa'i skabs der bsgrub pa'i ngag 'jug pa yin
no ///

3 skabs de la rten pa'i sbyor ba'i dbye ba

gsum pa ni phyir rgol ba la bzhi ste / phyogs chos dang khyab pa gnyi ga nges pa dang / gnyi ga ma
nges pa dang / phyogs chos nges la khyab pa ma nges pa dang / ^{143a4} khyab pa nges la phyogs chos ma
nges pa'o /

31 phyogs chos dang khyab pa gnyi ga nges pa

dang po la'ang bzhi' ste / gnyi ga la blo kha phyogs pa dang / gnyi ga la blo kha ma phyogs pa dang /
khyab pa la phyogs la phyogs chos la ma phyogs pa dang / phyogs chos la phyogs la khyab pa la ma
phyogs pa'o /

311 gnyi ga la blo kha phyogs pa

dang po ni rgol ba'i ngag la ltos pa myed par rang la rjes dpag gi rgyu tshang pas bsgrub byed dgod
pa'i yul ma yin ^{143a5} no /

312 gnyi ga la blo kha ma phyogs pa

gnyis pa la ni gnyi ga la dran pa gzod skyed dgos pas yang na **gang byas pa myi rtag ste bum pa bzhin
sgra byas pas** zhes chos mthun pa dang / **gang mi rtag pas stong pa de ni byas pas stong ste nam mkha'
bzhin sgra byas pas** zhes chos myi mthun pa gnyis 'god pa yin no /

313 khyab pa la phyogs la phyogs chos la ma phyogs pa

gsum pa la ni **sgra byas pas** zhes phyogs chos tsam rjod pa'i gzhan don no /

314 phyogs chos la phyogs la khyab pa la ma phyogs pa

bzhi pa la ni ^{143a6} **gang byas pa myi rtag bum pa bzhin** zhes rjes 'gro brjod pa dang / **gang myi rtag pas
stong pa de ni byas pas stong ste** zhes ldog khyab rjod pas te lnga pa'o /

32 gnyi ga ma nges pa

gnyi ga ma nges pa la **gang rgyu gzhan la ma ltos par rang nyid rgyu las 'byung pa de ni de'i ngo bor
nges te / mye la tsha ba bzhin / byas pa'ang rang gi rgyu las gzhan la ma ltos par myi rtag par skyed
pa'i rgyu dang ldan pas** zhes khyab pa bsgrub pa dang ^{143a7} **gang res 'ga' ba ni rgyu dang ldan ste bum
pa bzhin sgra'ang res 'ga' ba yin pas** zhes pas phyogs chos bsgrub pa ste gnyi ga bsgrub pa'i gzhan don
no /

33 khyab pa nges la phyogs chos ma nges pa

khyab pa nges la phyogs chos ma nges pa la ni gang byas pa myi rtag ste bum pa bzhin zhes khyab pa ston la gang res 'ga' ba de ni rgyu ldan yin te bum pa bzhin sgra ni res 'ga' ba yin pas zhes phyogs chos sgrub pas khyab pa ston ^{143a8} la phyogs chos bsgrub pa'i gzhan don ste /

34 *phyogs chos nges la khyab pa ma nges pa*²

de ltar rang rgyud kyi sbyor ba brgyad dang sngar bsgrub pa'i thal ba'i sbyor ba drug ste sbyor ba bcu bzhi yin no //³

phyogs chos tsam brjod pa'i gzhan don khas myi len na khyab pa shes la ma rjed pa la bsgrub pa'i ngag myi 'god dam / chos mthun pa lasogs pa 'god / dang po ltar na gnyi' ga shes la rjed pa la'ang bsgrub pa'i ngag myi 'god ^{143a9} par 'dod na ji ltar 'gog /

sngar rjes dpag ma skyes pas myi dgos pa'ang ma yin la khyab pa dang phyogs chos dran du bcug na rjes dpag skyed par nus pas myi nus pa'ang ma yin na sgrub pa'i ngag myi 'god pa'i rgyu mtshan myed do zhe na /

khyab pa shes la ma rjed pa la'ang phyogs chos ma dran pas rjes dpag ma skye pas bsgrub pa'i ngag mi dgos pa'ang ma yin la / phyogs chos ^{143b1} dran par byas na rjes dpag skye bas rjes dpag myi nus pa'ang ma yin na ci'i phyir bsgrub pa'i ngag myi 'god /

khyab pa shes la ma rjed pa la chos mthun pa dang myi mthun pa 'god do zhes smra na'ang

chos mthun pa bsgrub bya dang tshogs pa bsgrub pa'i ngag yin pa ji ltar dgag /

phyogs chos dang khyab pa rjed na bsgrub bya ma brjod kyang de la rtogs pa skye bas de rjod pa don myed do zhe ^{143b2} na /

phyogs chos rjod pa kho na las rjed dpag skye bas khyab pa'i ngag don myed do /

'dis ni phyogs chos shes la ma rjed pa la ldog khyab pa'am rjes 'gro' tsam rjod pa la'ang de ltar go bar bye ste / spros pas cog go //

'o na khyab pa ma rjed na phyogs chos tsam rjod la gnyi 'ga rjed pa la gnyi' ga rjod pas rgol ba mngon shes dang ldan pa[^s] dgos par 'gyur ro zhe na /

^{148b3} 'o na phyir rgol bas bsgrub bya rtogs na bsgrub pa'i ngag myi 'god la ma rtogs na 'god {sgrus} bsgrub pa'i ngag 'god pa la'ang rgol ba mngon shes dang ldan pa dgos par 'gyur ro /

gal te pha rol po sgra myi rtag par khas len na bsgrub pa myi 'god la khas myi len na 'god de / sgra mi rtag par tshad mas ma nges kyang nges par khas len na bsgrub pa 'god dgos kyang ma bkod ^{143b4} pa 'am sngar mi rtag par nges kyang ma nges par smra ba la rtags bkod pa rtags ma yin yang mngon shes myed pa rgol ba'i nyes pa ma yin no zhe na /

'dir yang khyab pa khas len na phyogs chos 'ba' zhig brjod la khas myi len na gnyi ga brjod de / khyab pa dran yang khas myi len pa la gnyi' ga rjod na khyab pa brjod pa lhag pa'i ngag yin yang mngon shes myed pa rgol ba'i ^{143b5} nyes pa ma yin no /

yang phyogs chos bsgrub pa 'am khyab pa bsgrub pa chos mthun pa 'am myi mthun par 'du bas sbyor ba gzhan ma yin no zhe na /

'o na rgyu [^{tham}d][⁺thams cad] dngos kyi rgyu 'ba' zhig yin pas brgyud pa'i rgyu gtan myed par 'gyur ro /

rdzas gcig rang gi 'bras bu la ltos nas dngos kyi rgyu yin yang 'bras bu'i 'bras bu la ltos nas brgyud pa'i rgyur yang myi 'gal lo ^{143b6} zhe na /

res 'ga' bas byas par bsgrub pa'ang byas pa bsgrub pa la ltos nas chos mthun pa [⁺am][⁺am] <mi> mthun par 'du'ang myi rtag pa bsgrub pa la ltos nas phyogs chos bsgrub pa'i gzhan don du myi 'gal lo /

khyab pa bsgrub pa dang gnyi ga bsgrub pa'ang de bzhin du blta' bar bya'o //

² This case is not exemplified in this text.

³ Cited by Śākya mchog ldan in *Rigs gter pham byed* I 139a1–2 (p. 277): *rigs pa'i dbang phyug phyas pas mdzad pa'i rnam par nges pa'i fi ka las / gzhan don rjes dpag gi dbye ba 'chad pa na / de ltar na rang rgyud kyi sbyor ba brgyad / sgrub pa'i thal ba'i sbyor ba drug ste / sbyor ba bcu bzhi yin no zhes gsung*. The six formulas in the case of proving consequences are discussed later in 'Od zer 148b9–149a5.

4 bsgrub pa'i ngag gi mtshan nyid

bzhi pa bsgrub pa'i ngag gi spyi'i mtshan nyid ni rang nyid kyis nges pa'i khyab pa dang phyogs chos
143b7 pha rol la'ang myi slu ba'i yul du grub par ston pa yin no //

Sa bcad table

1 rgol ba dang phyir rgol ba'i mtshan nyid.....	2
2 de la bsgrub pa'i ngag 'jug pa'i skabs.....	2
3 skabs de la rten pa'i sbyor ba'i dbye ba.....	2
31 phyogs chos dang khyab pa gnyi ga nges pa.....	2
311 gnyi ga la blo kha phyogs pa.....	2
312 gnyi ga la blo kha ma phyogs pa.....	2
313 khyab pa la phyogs la phyogs chos la ma phyogs pa.....	2
314 phyogs chos la phyogs la khyab pa la ma phyogs pa.....	2
32 gnyi ga ma nges pa.....	2
33 khyab pa nges la phyogs chos ma nges pa.....	2
34 phyogs chos nges la khyab pa ma nges pa.....	3
4 bsgrub pa'i ngag gi mtshan nyid.....	4